The Pinellas County Value Adjustment Board (VAB) met in the Clerk’s Fourth Floor Conference Room, Pinellas County Courthouse, 315 Court Street, Clearwater, Florida, at 1:05 P.M. on this date with the following members present:

Dave Eggers, County Commissioner, Chair
Pat Gerard, County Commissioner, Vice-Chair
Michael A. J. Bindman, Citizen Appointee (School Board)
Carol Cook, School Board Member
Frank L. Makowski, Citizen Appointee (Board of County Commissioners)

Also Present:
Claretha N. Harris, Chief Deputy Director, Finance
Norman Loy, Manager, Board Records
Bernie Young, Board Records
Mike Twitty, Property Appraiser
Robert Dunne, Property Appraiser’s Office
Kevin Hayes, Property Appraiser’s Office
Kevin McKeon, Property Appraiser’s Office
Uzma Syed, Property Appraiser’s Office
Jacina Haston, Assistant County Attorney
Rinky Parwani, VAB Counsel
Jenny Masinovsky, Board Reporter, Deputy Clerk
Other Interested Individuals

AGENDA

1. Meeting Called to Order
2. Select the Chair and Vice-Chair for the 2019 VAB Cycle
3. Citizens Who Wish to Comment on the VAB Process
4. Approval of the Minutes of the October 2, 2018 Meeting
5. Final Action on Recommendations of Special Magistrates
6. Final Impact Notice
7. Final Certification of the 2018 Tax Rolls
8. Selection of date to hold Organizational Meeting and First Certification Meeting for the 2019 VAB Cycle
9. Statistical Information – Past Three Years
10. Adjournment
CALL TO ORDER

Chair Eggers called the meeting to order at 1:05 P.M.

ELECTIONS OF CHAIR AND VICE-CHAIR FOR 2019

Chair Eggers pointed out that the Board Chair must be a County Commissioner; whereupon, Commissioner Gerard moved, seconded by School Board Member Cook and carried unanimously, that Commissioner Eggers be re-elected as Chair for the 2019 VAB cycle; whereupon, School Board Member Cook moved, seconded by Mr. Bindman and carried unanimously, that Commissioner Gerard be re-elected as Vice-Chair.

CITIZENS WISHING TO BE HEARD

Imran Thobani and Bill Peugh, Ryan LLC, distributed packets containing letters to the Board dated February 26 and January 8, 2019 and copies of the Special Magistrate recommendations regarding Value Petitions Nos. 2018-1034, 2018-1336, 2018-1052, 2018-1053, 2018-1098, and 2018-1101 heard on November 15 and 16, 2018. Mr. Thobani indicated that he is the petitioners’ representative and read into the record the requirements of Florida Department of Revenue Rule 12D-9.030, stating for the record that the Magistrate did not comply with it by failing to explain the basis for his recommendations to deny the petitions; whereupon, responding to query by Chair Eggers, Mr. Thobani indicated that he and Mr. Peugh are requesting that the above-referenced six petitions, representing the highest property values of the total 30 petitions by Ryan LLC heard on the above dates, be reheard in front of a different Special Magistrate.

During discussion and responding to queries by the members, Attorney Parwani indicated that while the Magistrate may not have offered a detailed rationale for his recommendations, he provided pertinent analysis of the petitions in accordance with the required criteria, including findings of fact and conclusions of law. In addition, she noted that the representative did not submit some of the evidentiary information to support the petitions.

Following discussion relating to the representative’s objectives for requesting a rehearing of the petitions and the Magistrate’s credentials, Commissioner Gerard moved, seconded by Mr. Makowski and carried unanimously, that the request for rehearing be denied.
MINUTES OF MEETING OF OCTOBER 2, 2018 – APPROVED

Commissioner Gerard moved, seconded by School Board Member Cook and carried unanimously, that the minutes of the meeting of October 2, 2018 be approved.

FINAL ACTION ON RECOMMENDATIONS OF SPECIAL MAGISTRATES – APPROVED

Commissioner Gerard moved, seconded by Mr. Makowski and carried unanimously, that the final recommendations of the Special Magistrates be approved.

FINAL IMPACT NOTICE

Chair Eggers indicated that information regarding the item is included in the agenda packet; and that no action is required.

FINAL CERTIFICATION OF 2018 TAX ROLLS – APPROVED

Commissioner Gerard moved, seconded by Mr. Bindman and carried unanimously, that the Chair be authorized to sign the final certification of the 2018 tax rolls.

2019 ORGANIZATIONAL MEETING TO BE HELD JULY 23, 2019 AND FIRST CERTIFICATION MEETING TO BE HELD OCTOBER 1, 2019

Following discussion, Mr. Bindman moved, seconded by Commissioner Gerard and carried unanimously, that the Board hold its 2019 Organizational Meeting on July 23, 2019 at 1:00 P.M. and First Certification Meeting on October 1, 2019 at 9:00 A.M.

STATISTICAL INFORMATION

Chair Eggers indicated that information regarding the item is included in the agenda packet.
ADJOURNMENT

Chair Eggers adjourned the meeting at 1:38 P.M.

__________________________________________
Chair